IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA ASHEVILLE DIVISION 1:19CV275

BOBBY DARRICK JONES,)	
Plaintiff,)	
Vs.) ORDER	
ANDREW M. SAUL,)	
Defendant.)))	

This matter is before the Court upon remand from the Fourth Circuit for further proceedings in light of the United States Supreme Court's decision in *Carr v. Saul*, 141 S. Ct. 1352 (2021).

The Plaintiff appealed the denial of disability benefits to this Court arguing, *inter alia*, that the Court should remand his case for a new hearing because the ALJ that presided over his case was not properly appointed under the Appointments Clause of the United States Constitution. This Court originally found that the Plaintiff had forfeited this challenge because he failed to raise it during the administrative proceedings. The Plaintiff appealed. While his case was pending at the Fourth Circuit, the Unites States Supreme Court issued its decision in the *Carr* case. In *Carr*, the Court held that social security plaintiffs do not forfeit an Appointments Clause challenge by failing to raise it at the agency level. *Id.* at 1356. Accordingly, this Court hereby remands this case for a new hearing and *de novo* decision by a different, properly appointed ALJ. *See Lucia v. S.E.C.*, 138 S. Ct. 2044, 2055 (2018).

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the decision of the Commissioner is hereby **reversed** and this action is hereby **remanded** under Sentence Four of § 405(g). Upon remand,

the Social Security Administration shall assign a new, properly appointed ALJ to Plaintiff's claim.

Signed: August 2, 2021

Graham C. Mullen

United States District Judge